
NEW DEVELOPMENTS
IN JUNGIAN
PSYCHOLOGY: JUNGIAN
PSYCHOLOGY HAS A
DAUGHTER

by Arnold Mindell

Delivered as a lecture in Zurich, Switzerland, May 11, 1987 and in Santa Cruz, California July 22, 1987. Ed. K. Ziegler.

In this paper, I would like to outline the development of process-oriented psychology, one of Jung's youngest daughters. This is only an overview; I will not go into detail about this work, since I have already done so in my books. Learning process

Arnold Mindell holds a diploma from the C. G. Jung Institute in Zürich as well as a master's degree in physics and a PhD in psychology. He is the founder of Process Oriented Psychology and the author of *The Dreambody*, *Working with the Dreaming Body*, *River's Way*, and *The Dreambody in Relationships*. He divides his time between the United States and Zürich, where he teaches and maintains a private practice. He loves riding his mountain bike and powder skiing in the Alps.

work also requires experiencing it, and so I recommend that interested readers also take part in a training seminar. For now, I want to tell you about this daughter's birth, her current relationship to Jung and the rest of his family, and her particular nature.

The Daughter Aspect

I call process-oriented psychology a daughter of Jung's because even though she is now growing up and carrying her own name, she comes from his household. His blood, spirit and history are hers as well.

How did she develop? From the inside it is clear to me, after 23-plus years of private psychotherapeutic practice, teaching, and giving training seminars on dream and body work and work with relationships, large groups, and people who are in psychotic or comatose states, or who are dying.

The Development of Process Work from Jungian Psychology

New developments in Jungian psychology began for me with excitement and frustration. I finished my studies at the Zurich Jung Institute at the end of the 1960s. My studies opened up for me a brand new world and helped me to gain an overview, to divine the meaning of events in my life. Jung created for me the possibility of delving deeply into my own dreams and learning how to work with the dream material of others. The process of active imagination enabled me to do psychotherapy with myself.

For me, then, new developments began with excitement about dream material and with wondering whether what I now knew about dreams could be used also in working with the body and with relationships. I became frustrated with just sitting and talking; I was fascinated with gestures, symptoms, odd or insistent physical sensations, and the different ways clients (for instance couples) had of relating to me and to each other.

Jung and Teleology

Jung's main tool in working with dreams seems to have been the paradigm called teleological philosophy. Jung extended this paradigm from Schopenhauer and other philosophers and applied it to psychic events. He found a causal philosophy insufficient which would "explain" them simply as pathological symptoms caused by illness. For instance, he reported (1965, pp. 124-25) a case which impressed him early in his career.

A woman who had been hospitalized for 50 years with a diagnosis of schizophrenia was in the habit of making "curious rhythmic motions with her hands and arms." This was dismissed by the other psychiatrists on staff as merely one more manifestation of her mental illness. Jung, however, was interested enough to ask an old nurse and the patient's brother about her history. He discovered that she had gone insane shortly after being rejected by a young man she had planned to marry; he had been a cobbler who made just such movements while sewing shoes.

The causal aspect of this behavior in the patient might be considered to be the emotional trauma of rejection by the man she loved. For Jung, its teleological, or purposive aspect clearly had to do with an identification with her beloved. Our problems are not just pathological states, said Jung; they can be understood as meaningful aspects of life. I began to wonder whether teleological thinking could also be applied to the body, whose symptoms have always been considered to be "sick."

Teleology

Teleology, like any paradigm, is much more powerful than those who use it may even recognize. A paradigm creates a way of looking at life and at people; it also creates all the tools necessary to work with these people. And so it also created the basic tools of body work for me.

Alchemy and Teleology

One of the tools generated by a teleological approach is the concept of individuation and its relationship to alchemy. Alchemy stresses the importance of cooking, as the method through which development takes place. Alchemy says, the *prima materia* is raw human nature, fears, body problems, all of your disturbances. Put your problems in the pot, do not dismiss them as sick, hold the pot together, cook them over the fire of your attention and involvement, and then they will change.

Teleology and the Heart

One's therapeutic philosophy is in itself a powerful intervention. Teleology, the belief that events have meaning and purpose, is such an intervention. One of the reasons it works is that it proves useful in so many apparently impossible pathological situations. Another reason it is useful is that it is a form of heartfulness which practically everyone needs. It is a way of feeling about people.

Assuming that what is happening to you is meaningful is what I would call a big-hearted approach to yourself. It is almost easier, though, to think that you and everyone else are sick and crazy.

Analysts fall back into reductive and causal thinking, in contrast to teleological thinking, because Jungian psychology is difficult to carry out in practice. They try to explain that who we are is due to our complexes or our past. They do not think: the way we are now could be useful and meaningful, and is in some sense correct.

Opening up to people with a form of heartfulness is not a simple business. You cannot just do it. First of all, most analysands are used to being criticized -- at least to being told that they need to change -- and expect it. Secondly, most of us are afraid of unexplained behavior, and out of fear tend to interpret as a defense. And thirdly, to be so tolerant, optimistic and open, the therapist has to feel well herself. If you are hurt or have been badly treated you are sad, depressed, bitter and angry and can no longer believe that others have something useful about them. They become pathological for you, and you explain everyone's behavior in terms of his father and mother, her father and mother complex, his anima, her animus. Reductive interpretations imply, "I am hurt by these people, I do not know how to work with them, I do not like them, let me call them pathological." If you hear me or another analyst talk like this about people, I recommend that you deal with us with compassion. Try saying that you hear I am hurt and no longer know what to do with someone, that I should say this directly to my client instead of talking to someone else against him or her.

Heartful openness to the *prima materia*, that is to what is brought to us, is the starting point of process-oriented psychology, and the reason why I call process work one of Jung's daughters. In process work, we do not attempt to reduce what is happening to something else; rather, we encourage the happening to unfold itself. We try to work with the process so that it can become self-explanatory. We take the dream, body problem, relationship difficulty and develop methods for unfolding these events and processes.

Jungian psychology tends in principle to focus with heart mostly upon such products of the alchemical process, of individuation, as dreams and the written, drawn, or painted records of active imagination. It attempts to unravel the meanings of the contents and to help the dreamer follow the inner flow of images.

Content and Process

Process work focuses upon dreams and also upon the way in which the dreaming process unfolds in other aspects of experience as well. We worship the dreaming process: thus we study its contents, its dream images, the body problems associated with it, and also the flow of the process, the way body symptoms -- or events in relationships or in the world around the dreamer -- develop and express themselves. Let me explain.

Interpretation and Channels

Process work is that extension of Jungian psychology which works with the various ways, or channels, in which the unconscious manifests: visually, in terms of dreams and imaginations; auditorily, in terms of how people speak, their tone of voice, and the content of what they say; movement, how they move and which movements are not completed; relationship, in terms of signals and positions (discussed further below, in section on *Transference and Love*); and events in the world, including synchronicities.

Channels and Types

What is the relationship between Jung's types and the channels? The channel is the momentary way in which the total personality expresses itself. The channel changes from moment to moment. The type is a characteristic way in which consciousness behaves. Jung did say that everyone has and uses all the functions and that a "type" is produced by what is only the relative predominance of one function (Jung, 1971). He describes the functions in themselves as well as the behavior of a person in whom one function predominates. Von Franz (1971) gives further examples of how the functions operate in different types. A recent development in Jungian psychology, the Singer-Loomis Inventory of Personality, uncouples the functions psychometrically, which allows for more accurate measurement of the actual strength of preference for each function. In other words, the details of this inventory's construction reflect the assumption that an individual is using all the functions to some degree and is not necessarily a representative of a type.

Nevertheless, the concept of channels seems to be more fluid and detailed than that of the functions. A process-oriented approach also identifies preferences for one channel or another. The emphasis in doing therapy, however, is on following minute-to-minute channel changes with detailed observational accuracy -- and assisting the integration (into more familiar channels) of material arising in a channel foreign to the client's usual consciousness.

Channels and Channel Switching

The individuation process sometimes focuses upon dreams; sometimes you become focused upon the body, relationships, world problems, dance or movement, etc. Sometimes it focuses on the development of intuition, sensation, feeling or thinking. Why does it switch and change? Why is it sometimes your dreams that fascinate you, sometimes your body, your relationships, and so on? The teleological reason is this: to be whole means that your way of perceiving must be as whole as possible. Knowing all sides of yourself means not just understanding yourself in an intellectual (usually visual) way, but also being able to use different channels to comprehend your multidimensionality.

Wholeness

If the client is to be whole, the therapeutic procedure and the therapist practising it should be as whole as possible and prepared to work in as many different ways as possible. If wholeness for the individual means having access to and awareness of all sides and all channels, then wholeness for the therapist may imply interest in working in the various channels which come up and being prepared to work with those which remain unconscious. This requires a lot of the therapist. But who can work in movement as well as with dreams, with massage as well as with relationship, with synchronicity as well as with relationships to the group? No one is this whole. However, we can train ourselves to be open to channels, and to learn to work in different ways, especially when we get tired of the old methods or are confronted with a client with whom we have no idea how to work.

Interpreting and Understanding vs. Other Modes

The main method of classical analysis is verbal interpretation, which in effect compares a mental image of an event in the client's life with an image-toned concept ("That is your mother-complex"). Understanding is important because it touches many channels but depends upon visual capacities. "Do you see?" means, "Can you see how to apply in other parts of your life what we have just talked about visually?" Understanding and gaining *in-sight* are important.

It is also very important to learn to feel knowingly as well, to feel something completely. Many body symptoms occur because we are not able to feel things complete-

ly. We can also move knowingly, relate knowingly and be in the world with awareness. Understanding is but one aspect of self-knowledge.

Proprioception

The world of feeling is what we call body proprioception. When a particular symptom is felt completely, it becomes clear that the symptom is a meaningful happening which also reflects the meaning of the person's recent dreams. (See my *Working with the Dreaming Body* for more information on bodywork.)

An Exercise

To follow more completely what I am saying, you may want to experiment with yourself. Notice whether or not you can feel a symptom you have had, a headache, skin problem, some recent body experience. Feel it, take a moment and just feel. Now, when you have felt it sufficiently, change channels, I mean, see the symptom's feelings. Make a picture out of the feeling you were just having of the symptom. Can you now connect this picture with a recent dream? This dream is a visualization of your present body experience. The body experience is a proprioception of the dream. Now feel the symptom, and remember the dream, and you can feel knowingly as well as understand.

Until now, the client striving for wholeness and interested in the various sides of the personality has usually had to change schools of thought and paradigms in order to pick up dance work, breath work, dreams, etc. I feel these different sides of the personality belong together, and that we must develop the teleological ideas of Jung to help them come together and be treated as a unit by helping professionals. One such development is process work.

Applications of Process Work

Process work can be applied in almost any normal circumstance. It is especially useful for the many people in special states which cannot be approached verbally or with insight. Think of little children, people in an acute psychotic episode, people in trance or having strong body experiences, near death or comatose -- to mention just a few -- who do not normally respond well to verbal interaction alone. We all want to extend psychology into the manifold dimensions of being human; one way to do so is to know in which channel people are communicating. When we know their channel, we can communicate with them through touch, movement, fantasy, music, relationship or medita-

tion. The autistic child frequently has a strong proprioceptive process and needs body contact. The person in a catatonic state can frequently be helped by a form of inner work and by relationship work. Working with someone in a coma requires knowledge of all the different channels. (See my *Coma: Key to Life*.) For example, one man I worked with, just before his death, was in a coma. He coughed and choked. This too was meaningful. We worked by amplifying his coughing. Out of this came song and many vocalizations. His channels changed, and we worked with his visions. He came back to consciousness and completed his life in a meaningful and beautiful way. Coma work is a special aspect of process work, in which channel changes and the ability to follow these changes can be very meaningful.

Another Question

Could it be dangerous to follow people's process; can process be trusted? In the past many thought it was dangerous to trust in people; certainly you must educate and control them, otherwise they could be dangerous.

Experience shows that it is most dangerous to follow only one part of the personality. To follow only the conscious process, or the unconscious situation alone, is not as useful as following the entire person. Following the total personality is never dangerous, because the personality seems to be a self-correcting system. It has its own wisdom, it is enlivening, fun, enjoyable. This is especially true in psychotic states, and even in comatose conditions. (Methods of bringing up the total personality are found in *City Shadows*.)

The Meaning of Process

The term "process" is defined to mean the total flow of what is happening, the conscious and also the unconscious. Process means the constant change of signals in their many channels. For example, right now you are thinking something or reading this article. And at the same time you are feeling something in your body, body pressures, temperatures, funny feelings here and there, and these are not only congruent with what you are thinking. You have a conscious and an unconscious mind.

Your process is not only what you are saying and doing, but also what you are feeling and what is happening in those around you. Your process is composed of the information in all of your different channels, your talk, your movements and relationships, your body feelings, your environment, etc. Process is defined in terms of the chang-

ing signals, the channels they appear in, and their distance from awareness. (See my *River's Way* for more detail on channels.)

Examples

For example, a man tells me that he is manic. He insists that he is crazy, that his doctors are right in diagnosing bipolar disorder. This is his primary process, the person he identifies himself as being. His talk and movements are as speedy as can be. Since his arms are moving nervously about, I encourage him to completely let his movements go, to amplify them in order to let them complete themselves and show us their teleological meaning. Soon he begins hitting my punching bag, and to his surprise discovers that he is angry at people from his past who mistreated him. I ask him where they are now, here in my office. He says that when he thinks of himself as crazy, he is putting himself down in the way they used to do to him. He becomes quiet and sad. This sadness is one aspect of his secondary process, the other side of his personality. Another aspect is the part of himself that mistreats him and puts him down. His manic behavior turns out to have been a form of anger with himself for being so self-critical.

Following the total process, the talk *and* the movements, was very useful. Just listening to him, or just working with his movement alone, would have been less valuable for him. What is problematical is the lack of relationship between the different processes (in this case anger and sadness), not the overall process itself.

Another type of client who is often considered dangerous is a murderer or potential murderer, e.g. a man with a history of violent wife-beating. Such people often identify themselves primarily with their sense of responsibility and sensitivity to others' feelings. In doing therapy with someone like this, I may propose that we work in a movement channel with his background aggression. If while we are doing this I pick up cues that he might be about to become violent, I say to him something like, "And now don't forget, please, to be a loving father as well." This again helps bring the two processes into relationship with one another in a way that is often very fruitful. In a case like this, for instance, the man might learn to criticize in a caring and constructive way.

A New Language?

Why is it necessary for process-oriented psychology to use a new terminology, to speak of primary and secondary processes, channels and edges? Adding yet more psychologi-

cal jargon is always disagreeable and should be avoided wherever possible. However, one of the reasons for the new language is that it has become necessary to find neutral terms not based upon the paradigm in which matter and psyche are seen as split -- in other words, terms that could be used in all channels and states.

Jung must have seen this new language coming when he wrote in *Mysterium Coniunctionis* that as psychology and physics come together, a new and neutral language to describe events will develop which would be neither psychological nor physical. He intuited that this new language would be mathematical. Those of you who have read von Franz's *Number and Time* will get an inkling, I think, of how this neutral language might sound.

Process-oriented psychology is another attempt at formulating a neutral language which is neither physical nor psychological. Process theory is aimed at applications; it is based upon information and concepts, since these allow us to differentiate how our clients are expressing themselves instead of our reframing their expressiveness in terms of channels with which we can work.

When we speak of body problems and dreams in process work, we do so with the awareness that we are relating only to the client's conscious vocabulary. "The body," "dream," "matter," "psyche" are only conscious concepts. If we follow the individual's verbal and nonverbal gestures, then we notice that she speaks of pains and feelings, she speaks of seeing things, of having troubles with this person or that. Instead of reframing this and saying oh, these are body feelings or dreams, these are psychic and these are material events, we work neutrally (and without metacomment to her) with movement or proprioception, visualizations and other channels.

Channel Switching

If you feel something now and in a few minutes begin to imagine something, then your process has switched channels. Feeling pain is proprioceptive; knowing yourself means learning how to feel your body and realizing that your process becomes visual at certain points. If you begin to move, your ability to work kinesthetically becomes important. Information and channel language are neutral.

Example

A child lying in the hospital after a bone tumor operation complained about pains in his arms. The arm, or tumor, was still expanding, he said. Several months later, the

cancer reappeared on the arm. This time we did not go to the hospital with the child. "Let's feel and pretend the tumor grows more," I suggested to the child, amplifying the process proprioceptively. "Ouch, bigger and bigger," said the child. "Oh, it ... it is becoming a balloon and floating away." So away the two of us went on a visual trip. We travelled far from school, into the countryside. After talking with the parents, we all decided to let the child actually have three months off from school and visit the grandparents in the countryside. The child's tumor spontaneously went down.

Healing and Integrating

I did not talk with this family about psyche or matter, or dreams (fantasies) or body. The child first experienced his process proprioceptively in terms of a tumor, then visually as a balloon, then as a world event in that he left school. Integrating dreams and body phenomena is frequently healing.

Where does the healing effect come from? The classical explanation would have to do with insight and integration. Although I too use terms like healing or integrating, sickness or health, I do not understand them. Are these terms useful? I suspect that it is not always useful to think in terms of matter and psyche, chemistry and dreams. We can also think like alchemists. In practice, when a body experience is cooked, felt completely, seen, and lived in outer life, people feel better. Process work creates change in one's dreams and body feelings, and we often refer to these body changes as symptom relief. But the word "symptom" is a conscious, cultural term. It is safest to say that processes are teleological: if we accept them and cook them, they bring us gold, which means at least insight and, at the most, lots of energy and different body experiences.

Analyst and Process Worker

Normally, the analyst in Jungian psychology plays a far greater role than the analysand in creating insight, as the name "analyst" implies. In process work, the client's own process does most of the work. I think the best analyst is a process worker, and that the best process worker can analyse as well as catalyze intense experiences. Therefore I use the terms "process worker" and "analyst" interchangeably. Jungian analysts who work teleologically are basically process workers. Really good process workers are extending Jungian psychology.

Dreams, Their Own Interpretations

In process work, dreams and body symptoms appear to be events which are trying to unfold their messages. Jung would have said that dreams interpret themselves. I think he meant that if the dreaming process unfolds, in dreams, body and the world, it explains itself. Following the dreaming process in different channels, as we have just seen, is healing and illuminating.

Having a Process: A New Idea for Modern People

This self-illuminating and healing quality of the process is astounding because people are unused to believing in what is happening to them. That is why we go so quickly to advisors and doctors to hear about ourselves. We have not learned to trust and amplify our visions, feelings, and experience of relationships since we have mostly lost hope for them. It may be that we have lost hope because, until now, we have not had the necessary tools to unravel the mystery of our processes. They are however, what Jung called the Self. The totality of our processes contain the wisdom and healing we see in wise, old dream figures.

Following the Tao is an ancient idea, and yet at the same time it will also always be completely new. People are not used to believing that there is a magical something in their problems which knows the way and which is trying to manifest itself in the form of symptoms and dreams.

Transference and Love

Where does the transference and countertransference fit into process work? At a certain moment in the work, the analysand's development depends upon the analyst's expertise and real human nature. Jung called the dropping of the usual therapeutic procedure, the real person-to-person contact, getting into the same bath water. Both people develop consciousness together. Both are cleaning up and transforming one another. He said that it is important to be open about yourself when this is called for.

In process work this opening may happen in many ways. One way is through the work with double signals. (See *The Dreambody in Relationships*.) Double signals are

the living unconscious, combining a conscious and an unconscious message, like saying "yes" to someone while unconsciously shaking your head in a "no" gesture, thus sending two messages simultaneously.

Getting into the bath water means many things: one of them is not only talking about feelings and dreams, but also working on the bath water, the living unconscious, in the form of double signals -- right when they occur.

One analysand recently complained that I always seemed to be aloof. This I fervently denied -- no one was more personal than I! She agreed with me but insisted nevertheless that something irrational in her was telling her that I was aloof. She felt that we had already been working long enough on her parental projections, that she knew as much as possible about them and that they were not causing her feeling. I noticed that when I defended myself, I was not just speaking words to her, but also sending a message through the high pitch of my voice.

I listened to my tone of voice for a moment, and then had to admit embarrassedly that there was something like a baby in my voice. She said, "Don't be embarrassed, process it like you have told me to do." So I identified for a moment with the baby in me, and to my surprise many needs surfaced in me. I needed, for example, to ask her to help me on one of my projects. She was delighted to help out and not be considered just an unconscious analysand. She decided to start growing out of her childlike role. Meanwhile I changed by learning to be more of a child, which in fact was what I had dreamed about the night before. I was acting like an aloof adult as a defense against my own kid, but had not realized it. We were bathing together.

Dreambody and Beyond

It is difficult to speak about the various working aspects of process-oriented psychology in a limited space, yet I am tempted to do so. Perhaps it will be sufficient merely to mention certain facts and imply others. One basic concept is what I call the dreambody. This term is derived from the discovery that body experiences, when amplified and allowed to unfold, mirror dreams. The fact that an individual's dreams can be found in his double signals as they appear in relationships gave rise to the concept of the couple's dreambody. The global dreambody is the dreaming process found in the background of large groups; it is Jung's collective unconscious, the unconscious as it appears in the way people arrange themselves in a group, the way they sit, and the feelings they normally do not express. There is much to discover about the global dreambody;

it is an urgent research topic for us all. (I go into more detail on this in my unpublished manuscript *Working with Planetary Processes*.)

Training

Teaching and learning process work involves working in various channels and studying dreams and mythology, psychopathology and extreme states, dance and movement, yoga and meditation, signals and information exchange, body and dream work, relationship and collective theory. It includes video studies as well.

To work with double signals, it is important to train ourselves to observe what people do and how they do it. One way of doing this is for students to work with other students under supervision. This way of studying happens in every school. You learn about dreams, for instance, and then before you know it you are experimenting with your dream work not only on your family but with all of your student friends. Another way is to use video feedback to discover the living unconscious. We need intellectually-oriented classes, and we also need experiential seminars to practice working with one another on dreams, relationships, body work, dance and movement.

Shadows

I do not always practice what I preach and write. I say how important it is to understand and appreciate the various forms of therapy, therapists and clients. But I must admit I have not always been successful in doing this. When I was starting out, the discovery of process ideas excited me and I sometimes reacted in ways that, looking back, I do not feel very good about. I have not always been tolerant; sometimes I was hasty. I was so excited by what I was doing that I could not understand why everyone did not stand up and clap when a new idea came around. In my insecurity, I have irritated some of those closest to me, and in my enthusiasm I am sure I created unnecessary problems.

I mention this here because the shadow belongs to psychology -- it is real -- and because every new idea seems, for better or for worse, to develop unconsciously. The ones doing new things see the others as misoneistic people who are unconscious and not open to new things, as people holding onto their old identities. But is this the way

psychology really has to develop? New therapeutic modes create conflict and antagonism out of sheer unconsciousness of the overall worldview.

Psychology and its development should be a model for a relatively peaceful development of new ideas from older ones, a paradigm which shows others how to grow together, to use our conflicts to differentiate and improve our ideas. This is not easy to do, but perhaps keeping in mind our global expectations for peaceful growth and progress will enable us to act locally with tolerance as well as criticism, doubt as well as openness.

Bibliography

- Goodbread, Joseph H. *The Dreambody Toolkit: A Practical Introduction to the Philosophy, Goals and Practice of Process-Oriented Psychology*. London and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987.
- Jung, C. G. *Memories, Dreams, Reflections*. New York: Random House, 1965.
- _____. *Mysterium Coniunctionis* (CW 14), 2nd edition. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1970.
- _____. *Psychological Types* (CW 6). Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1971.
- Mindell, Arnold. *Dreambody: The Body's Role in Revealing the Self*. Santa Monica: Sigo Press, 1982 and London and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1984.
- _____. *Working with the Dreaming Body*. London and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1985.
- _____. *River's Way: The Process Science of the Dreambody*. London and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1985.
- _____. *The Dreambody in Relationships*. London and Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1987.
- _____. *City Shadows: Psychological Interventions in Psychiatry*. Routledge, 1988.

_____. *Inner Dreambodywork: Working with Yourself Alone in Process-Oriented Meditation*. Routledge, in press.

_____. *Coma: Key to Life*. Routledge, to be published.

_____. *The Year I; Working with Planetary Processes*. Routledge, to be published.

Singer, June and Loomis, Mary. *The Singer-Loomis Inventory of Personality: Interpretive Guide*. Palo Alto: Consulting Psychologists Press, 1984.

von Franz, Marie-Louise. "The Inferior Function," in *Lectures on Jung's Typology* (ed. M. Stein). New York: Spring Publications, 1971.

_____. *Number and Time*. London: Rider and Company, 1974.